

MINUTES
MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS
PLANNING & EXTERNAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE
METROPOLITAN ATLANTA RAPID TRANSIT AUTHORITY

December 10, 2015

The Board of Directors Planning & External Relations Committee met on December 10, 2015 at 10:37 a.m. in the Board Room on the 6th Floor of the MARTA Headquarters Building, 2424 Piedmont Road, Atlanta, Georgia.

Board Members Present

Robert Abdul-Salaam
Robert F. Dallas
Jim Durrett
Roderick E. Edmond
Noni Ellison-Southall, *Chair*
Jerry Griffin
Freda Hardage

MARTA officials in attendance were: General Manager/CEO Keith T. Parker, AICP; Chief Operating Officer Richard A. Krisak; Chief Financial Officer Gordon L. Hutchinson; Chief Administrative Officer Edward L. Johnson; Chief Counsel Elizabeth O'Neill; Chief of Staff Rukiya S. Thomas; AGMs, Wanda Dunham, Robin Henry, Ming Hsi, Ryland McClendon, Terry Thompson and Donald Williams (Acting); Executive Director Ferdinand Risco; Directors Lyle Harris, Jennifer Jinadu-Wright and Carol Smith ; Managers Tony Griffin and Robert H. Thomas; Executive Manager to the Board Rebbie Ellisor-Taylor; Manager, Executive Office Administration Tyrene L. Huff; Finance Administrative Analyst Tracy Kincaid. Others in attendance Davis Allen, Abebe Girmay, Nicholas Gowens, Saba Long, Srinath Remala and Negesha Stone-Boyd.

Also in attendance Jack Buckingham of MATC; Jim Schmid of HNTB.

Consent Agenda

- a) Approval of the November 5, 2015 Planning & External Relations Committee Meeting Minutes

On motion by Mr. Griffin seconded by Mr. Durrett the Consent Agenda was unanimously approved by a vote of 6 to 0, with 6 members present.

Individual Agenda

Briefing – Title VI Fare Equity Analysis

Mr. Williams briefed the Committee on the Title VI Fare Equity Analysis of the FY 2016 proposed fare media fee increase.

FTA Title VI Requirements

- FTA Circular 4702.1B requires Board approval of Fare & Fare Media changes
- Prior to implementing any fare or fare media changes, MARTA must:
 - Complete a Fare Equity Analysis to determine if low-income populations bear disproportionate burden of changes
 - Ensure fare changes do not result in disparate impacts on the basis of
 - Race
 - Color
 - National origin
- Upon completion of Fare Equity Analysis, MARTA must:
 - Brief the Board of Directors regarding the fare or fare media changes and the equity impacts of the fare change(s) on the impacted population

Fare Policy

- Approved by Board in February 2013 to satisfy Title VI Circular 4702.1B
- MARTA Fare Policy includes 4-step analyses followed for this study
- Proposed media fee increase
 - Offset cost of more secure Breeze media
 - \$0.50 to \$1.00 per ticket
 - \$1.00 to \$2.00 per card

Methodology

- Customer Panel Demographic Survey
 - Total of 1,689 surveys collected
 - Included detailed demographic and fare payment method information

- Conducted on fixed bus and rail systems
- Difference in Proportions Test applied to garner results at a 95% confidence level

Demographic Groups Measured

- Disparate Impact Testing
 - Black vs. non-Black
 - White vs. non-White
 - "Other" vs. non-"Other", where "Other" refers to that response, plus Asian, American Indian, etc.
 - Hispanic vs. non-Hispanic
- Disproportionate Burden Testing
 - At or below Poverty vs. above Poverty
- Additional Analysis on Special Groups
 - Not over 65 vs. over 65 years of age
 - Transit Dependent vs. non Transit Dependent
 - Male vs. Female

Fare Media Usage

- Short-Term Time Period – 24.60%
- Base Fare Stored Value – 21.50%
- Base Fare Stored Trip – 18.20%
- Long-Term Time Period – 18.10%
- Reduced Fare – 9.80%

Breeze Media Usage

- Non-Breeze – 5%
- Breeze Ticket Users – 20%
- Breeze Card Users – 75%

Study Results

- Black MARTA customers, other Non-White riders more likely to be disparately impacted by \$1.00 media fee increase for card purchases
- No statistically significant disproportionate burden on low-income customers was identified
- Women are more likely to be affected by the \$0.50 media fee increase for ticket purchases
- Other populations disproportionately affected by the fee increase, are majority class groups and therefore not protected
 - Non-Black ticket users
 - White ticket users
 - Male card users

Mr. Risco briefed the Committee on the Mitigation Plan recommended by MARTA's Office of Diversity & Inclusion.

Mitigation Plan

- To mitigate the impact to low-income and the minority populations, the Office of Diversity and Inclusion recommends the following:
 - A robust communication plan to the impacted populations by increasing marketing to minority, low-income and LEP communities in various languages through special outreach initiatives and notifications
 - Offer a Breeze Cards exchange program, allowing current card holders the opportunity to exchange an old card for the new fare-media
 - Begin the exploration of expanding Breeze Card or ticket purchase locations beyond the BVM and on-line service
 - Provide advance notification of fare Breeze Cards and ticket price changes to minority, low-income and LEP populations

Dr. Edmond asked how will the Breeze Card exchange program work.

Mr. Risco said patrons will be able to exchange their Breeze card for a new, secured Breeze card – all rides will be transferred to their new card.

Mr. Griffin asked how does MARTA know who is a part of the low-income and LEP community.

Mr. Risco said MARTA communicates with various groups that are in the Title VI area.

Mr. Williams added that the exchange program will target all patrons; however, MARTA is seeking to minimize the impact on low-income and minority populations.

Briefing – Bus Shelters

Mr. T. Griffin briefed the Committee on MARTA's Bus Shelter Program.

Program History General

- Advertising Bus Shelter RFP issued in 2007 to increase revenue and improve shelter maintenance
- Marketing assumed shelter program oversight in 2008
- Outfront Media, Inc. (Outfront) maintains all 700 amenities (400 in previous agreement)
- Outfront Agreement Revenue
 - 15-year term (2008-2022)
 - Total Revenue/Minimum Guarantee (MG) \$34.5M, MARTA receives \$17.25M (50%)

Program History: Contract Benefits vs. Prior Contract

- Revenue average \$1.15M per year to MARTA (vs. \$300,000)
- Outfront services all bus shelters, saving MARTA \$300,000 annually
- Outfront replaces old brown shelters (over 10 yrs. old) with new shelters (silver and glass)

Key Bus Shelters and Bench Statistics

- Service Area: Fulton County, DeKalb County, City of Atlanta & Clayton County
- Bus Routes in Service Area: 97
- Service Area Bus Stops: Approx. 9,100
- Advertising (Ad) Bus Shelters: 410

- Non-Advertising (Non-Ad) Bus Shelters: 228
- Benches: 104
- Simme Seats: 4

Bus Shelter Installation Responsibility

- MARTA (Non-Ad)
 - MARTA installs non-ad bus shelters/benches (only)
 - MARTA directs Outfront Media to install non-ad bus shelters
- Outfront Media (Ad and Non-Ad)
 - Outfront installs ad bus shelters with MARTA's approval
 - Outfront installs non-ad bus shelters and benches as directed by MARTA

Non-Ad Bus Shelter Phase I

- Customers, staff, and/or elected officials request bus shelter
- All requests submitted to Bus Shelter Coordinator
- Each request is logged and evaluated against Service Standard
 - Yes
 - Continue to Phase 2
 - No
 - Bus Shelter Coordinator notifies requestor

Non-Ad Bus Shelter Phase II

- Site location given to Outfront for ad shelter
 - Yes
 - Outfront takes site location and builds ad shelter
 - No
 - MARTA to perform Site Survey to test setback, grade, site distance, etc.
 - Continue to Phase 3

Non-Ad Bus Shelter Phase III

- Site Survey approved
 - Yes
 - Prepare Site Evaluation Form scoring five factors: boardings, proximity to other bus shelters, number of routes, Senior/Public Centers, and Title VI areas
 - Total and rank according to score on request list
 - Continue to Phase 4
 - No
 - Bus Shelter Coordinator notifies requestor

Non-Ad Bus Shelter Phase IV

- Identify location for installation
- Stakeholders, including staff, property owner, and permitting jurisdiction approve
 - Yes
 - MARTA builds non-ad shelter/Outfront builds non-ad shelter
 - No
 - Bus Shelter Coordinator notifies requestor

Mr. Griffin requested that the Board receive the criteria used for the site evaluations.

Mr. Dallas asked is safety a part of the criteria.

Mr. T. Griffin said yes, part of the ranking involves safety requirements. In addition, each jurisdiction provides an inspection for permit purposes.

Mr. Dallas asked how does MARTA handle ad complaints.

Mr. T. Griffin said ad complaints are rare. If complaints are received, MARTA pulls the majority of the time.

Mrs. Abdul-Salaam asked how is shelter maintenance handled.

Mr. T. Griffin said MARTA requires shelters to show a number to call for complaints.

Mrs. Abdul-Salaam asked about bus shelters in Clayton County.

Mr. T. Griffin said MARTA is building non-ad shelters in Clayton County.

Briefing – Transit Advertising

Mr. Griffin briefed the Committee on MARTA's Transit Advertising Program update.

New Outfront Media, Inc. Agreement – Status

- New 5-Year Agreement Effective January 1, 2015
- Reduction in Revenue Expected
- 5-Year MG is \$17M (Year 1 – \$3.2M)
- 2015 Outfront billings \$6.1M (through October)
- MARTA Revenue Year-to-Date is \$4M (50% higher than anticipated)
- Outfront projects 2015 billings of \$7.2M (highest in 15 Years)
- MARTA anticipated to earn \$4.7M for 2015 (\$1.5M over MG)

Other Matters

Mrs. McClendon announced the following events:

- Georgia Transit Association Annual Conference
December 9-11, 2015
- DeKalb County Jurisdictional Briefing
January 5, 2016
- Annual State of MARTA Breakfast
January 7, 2016
- Georgia Chamber Eggs & Issues Breakfast
January 12, 2016

Adjournment

The Planning & External Relations Committee meeting adjourned at 11:27 a.m.